

“No Blanket to be Worn in School”:

The Education of Indians in Early Nineteenth-Century Ontario

by J. Donald WILSON*

I

To quote the Harvard historian, Bernard Bailyn, education always has “shifting functions, meanings and purposes.”¹ Who defines these functions, meanings and purposes, and why, become essential questions for the educational historian. Several recently completed studies have discussed these questions in relation to the appearance of mass education in Canada in the last century.² Little attention, however, has been paid to the impact of educational institutions on children of minority groups, whether under church or state control. One is particularly struck by the lack of recent studies on the education of Canadian Indians.³ This paper constitutes an attempt to reconsider the education of Indians in Upper Canada from the coming of the white man in large numbers in the 1780’s up to the Union of the Canadas in 1841.

Throughout Canadian history from the time of Champlain’s arrival in New France in 1608 there have been three basic views on Indian-white relations: integration or assimilation into the white culture which, although often a numerical minority, remained dominant because of its technological power over the Indian culture; biracial harmony by which both Europeans and “civilized” Indians would live in mutual cooperation; segregation of the Indian from the white population by means of reservations. These views were all seriously contemplated and their implementation attempted at various times before the British conquest in

* Department of History, Lakehead University. The author wishes to thank Professor F. H. Armstrong of the University of Western Ontario and Professor M. Elizabeth Arthur of Lakehead University for their helpful comments and suggestions on an earlier draft of this paper. A grant in aid of research from the Chancellor’s Fund of Lakehead University is also gratefully acknowledged.

¹ Bernard BAILLYN, *Education in the Forming of American Society* (New York: Random House, 1960), p. 14.

² For example, J. Donald WILSON, R. M. STAMP and L.P. AUDET (eds.), *Canadian Education: A History* (Scarborough: Prentice-Hall, 1970), chaps. 5-16; Michael B. KATZ (ed.), “Education and Social Change in English Speaking Canada,” Special Issue of *History of Education Quarterly*, XII, (Fall, 1972).

³ A new study on the history of the Canadian Indian has little to say about Indian education. E. Palmer PATTERSON II, *The Canadian Indian. A History Since 1500* (Don Mills: Collier-Macmillan, 1972). Nor does an article by R. J. SURTEES, “The Development of an Indian Reserve Policy in Canada,” *Ontario History*, Vol. XLI, no. 2 (June, 1969), pp. 87-98.

1760. But, interestingly enough, they remained present after the conquest as well. In the period which concerns us here all three views were considered by the British and Canadian authorities but particularly the notion of assimilation, treatment of which constitutes the bulk of this paper, and segregation.

The sociologist, Pierre van den Berghe, defines race as "a human group that defines itself and/or is defined by other groups as different from other groups by virtue of innate and immutable physical characteristics," and racism as "any set of beliefs that organic, genetically transmitted differences (whether real or imagined) between human groups are intrinsically associated with the presence or the absence of certain socially relevant abilities or characteristics, hence that such differences are a legitimate basis of invidious distinctions between groups socially defined as races."⁴ The Conquest of New France and the arrival of British settlers in large numbers, especially the influx of the Loyalists following the American Revolution, made it seem likely that since these settlers were intent upon permanent colonization they would either dominate, oust or conquer the indigenous population. In the case of Upper Canada, British-American relations with the Indian seem to exemplify what R.A. Schermerhorn calls "minimal" racism. In distinguishing between "minimal" and "maximal" racism, Schermerhorn says that "in its *minimal* form, racism defined darker peoples as backward or less evolved, different in degree but not in kind from their masters, therefore capable with training and education, to rise...to a status of equality with the ruling group."⁵ This is not to say that British-Americans did not at times incline towards "maximal" racism in their relations with the Indian population, but at the outset of contact, as I hope to show below, there was every evidence they proposed to follow the doctrine of the Puritans, the forbears of many British-Americans. For the Puritans,

...there was no doctrine of racial inferiority to blind the Puritans to the desirability of civilizing and Christianizing the American aborigines. To be sure, the Englishmen looked on the red men as culturally inferior, but this could be overcome by exposing the native to the benefits of European civilization.⁶

The best means of "exposure" was to subject the Indians or their children to some sort of education, or more accurately "schooling", since

⁴ PIERRE VAN DEN BERGHE, *Race and Racism* (New York: John Wiley, 1967), pp. 9, 11.

⁵ R. A. SCHERMERHORN, *Comparative Ethnic Relations* (New York: Random House, 1970), pp. 73-74. He continues: "The key notion in *maximal* racism becomes the inherent superiority of peoples with lighter color, together with its obverse, the inherent inferiority of the darker colored. In this view, the rule of the former over the latter is therefore inevitable, not arbitrary."

⁶ ALDEN T. VAUGHAN, *New England Frontier: Puritans and Indians, 1620-1675* (Boston: Little Brown, 1965), pp. 20-21.

long before the arrival of the white man the Indians had been "educating" their children in their own way.⁷ For Indians to be civilized or "reclaimed or their condition . . . effectively improved,"⁸ the influence of Christianity was deemed absolutely necessary. They must be turned from their pagan ways and made good Christians.⁹ But to ensure true conversion, it was felt necessary to make them literate first, so as to enable them to read the Bible and prayerbook. Borrowing from Marshall McLuhan, one historian in speaking of the English-based Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts (S.P.G.) has aptly spoken of the need they saw to convince the Indian of "the benefits of the Anglican version of the white man's alphabetic culture."¹⁰ Thus the conversion of Indians to Christianity and thereby civilizing them was dependent upon making them literate and in some way educating or "schooling" them. Unfortunately even after some Indians had acquired the white man's religion and culture, they found they could still not escape the sobriquets of "uncivilized" and "savage," characteristics which ultimately prevented their attainment of equal status with whites.¹¹ Then, too, Upper Canada advanced economically and socially and when the Indians' traditional livelihood based on hunting and trapping had gone into decline, concern developed in official quarters over the Indians' failure to engage in productive activity. Conversion and "civilization" was not enough. Reformers then promoted the idea of schools of industry in order to teach the natives useful skills like carpentry and cabinet-making.

The major watershed in Indian-white relations in Upper Canada coincided with the 1830 transfer of responsibility for Indians from the military authority to the civil governors in each of the Canadas. Before that, governmental concern centred on the maintenance of Indian loyalty to the Crown "with almost the sole object of preventing their hostility and of conserving their assistance as allies." Thereafter with his usefulness as an ally past, the civilization of the Indian became the ideal. The government then saw its duty to raise the Indian "from the debased condition into which he had fallen owing to the loose and pampering

⁷ Bernard Bailyn's phrasing encapsulates this notion of education as "the entire process by which a culture transmits itself across the generations". *Op. cit.*, p. 14.

⁸ Rev. Dr. Alder to Lord Glenelg, December 14, 1837. J. G. HODGINS (ed.), *Documentary History of Education in Upper Canada* (28 vols., Toronto: L. K. Cameron, 1893-1904), IV, 123. Hereafter referred to as *D.H.E.*

⁹ The British Government should ensure that the Indians "shake off the rude habits of savage life, and . . . embrace Christianity and civilization." Maj. Gen. Darling (Superintendent of Indian Affairs), to Dalhousie, 1828, in Report of the English Aboriginal Society, 1839. *D.H.E.*, IV, 128.

¹⁰ John CALAM, *Parsons and Pedagogues: The S.P.G. Adventure in American Education* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1971), p. 44.

¹¹ For details, see James W. St. G. Walker, "The Indian in Canadian Historical Writing," Canadian Historical Association, *Historical Papers*, 1971, pp. 21-51.

policy of former days.”¹² In announcing the policy Sir George Murray, Secretary of State for the Colonies, stated that it was based on “the settled purpose of gradually reclaiming the Indians from a state of barbarism and introducing amongst them the industrious and peaceful habits of civilized life.”¹³

II

The first schooling of Indians in Ontario was conducted in French and Indian dialect by the Jesuit missionaries in Huronia from 1639 to 1649. I propose in this paper, however, to deal exclusively with the Anglo-Protestant concepts and practices affecting Indian education in Upper Canada. The first known Indian school using English was set up by the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel for the Six Nations at the Bay of Quinté in 1784. Just as in the American colonies, the S.P.G. was the missionary arm of the Church of England and one of its main concerns was the conversion of the Indians. Among the Six Nations Indians on the Grand River, a teacher was maintained by the government from 1785, almost from the time of their arrival in Canada.¹⁴ An interesting report in 1810 underscored the suspicion held by some of their elders about the value of formal education.

...many of the old men are not certain whether this School is of use or not — for some by learn[ing]. [sic] to read not only become idle, but contract habits of Idleness which prevent them from excelling in the [...] They also object & this is a remarkable objection, that while they are under the care of the Schoolmaster their manners are neglected; & again that many who have learnt to read & write are not the better for it unless they continue to read after they have left school. This is an objection of a nature which I fear is but too common; for they cannot have any great number of Books: & it is needless to add that the improvement of those who cannot get access to these few, must necessarily be inconsiderable.¹⁵

At Fairfield on the Thames River in western Ontario an Indian school was opened in 1793 among the Delawares by the Rev. David Zeisberger, a Moravian missionary.¹⁶ Both English and Delaware were taught and books in both languages were read including Zeisberger's Indian and English spelling book. In 1801 the Moravian missionaries at Fairfield petitioned

¹² Duncan C. SCOTT, “Indian Affairs, 1763-1841” in Adam SHORTT and A. G. DOUGHTY (eds.), *Canada and its Provinces* (23 vols., Toronto: Glasgow, Brook and Company, 1914), IV, 695.

¹³ Cited in *ibid.*, p. 724.

¹⁴ Public Archives of Canada (P.A.C.), Q. Series, 24(1). 71, R. Mathews to Nepean, April 8, 1785.

¹⁵ “The Educational Problems of the Confederacy About 1810,” in Charles M. JOHNSTON (ed.), *The Valley of the Six Nations* (Toronto: Champlain Society, 1964), p. 245.

¹⁶ For an account of the Fairfield settlement and Zeisberger's work among the Indians, see John MORRISON (ed.), “Extracts from the Journal of David Zeisberger,” ONTARIO HISTORICAL SOCIETY, *Papers and Records*, XII (1914), pp. 179-98, and Elma E. GRAY, *Wilderness Christians* (Toronto: Macmillan, 1956), part II.

the government for an Indian agricultural school. Here was perhaps the earliest example of the "school-of-industry" concept. The aim was "to lead them [the Indians] on to a state of cultivation by keeping schools, teaching them to read, write, and cipher, and instructing them in agriculture, etc."¹⁷

By the 1820's increasing concern about the disposition and education of the province's Indian population is clearly evident. On the Governmental level first Maitland and then Colborne, successive lieutenant-governors, gave leadership in these matters. Church of England, Roman Catholic, and Methodist clergymen, in particular John Strachan, Alexander Macdonell, and Egerton Ryerson respectively, also gave their support in this as in other realms of public education. Spearheading a crusade of his own, the Rev. Thaddeus Osgood made a special contribution to the cause of Indian education.

Lieutenant-Governor Sir Peregrine Maitland (1818-1828) was responsible for setting up in 1826 a village for the Mississaugas on the Credit River near York (Toronto). Skilled workmen and teachers were sent among the Indians to aid in their "civilization." The Rev. John Strachan, later Anglican bishop of Toronto, reported good progress being made by virtue of the fact that the Indians had "abjured intoxicating liquors."¹⁸ This measure of a good educational system is noteworthy. The Rev. Peter Jones, a Methodist missionary, also remarked upon the apparent success of the settlement. The Indians there had comfortable houses, furniture, "window curtains, boxes and trunks for their wearing apparel, small shelves fastened against the wall for their books, closets for their cooking utensils, cupboards for their plates, cups, saucers, knives and forks; some had clocks and watches."¹⁹ The lessons of "civilization" were obviously taking effect.

Strachan himself played his part in promoting Indian education. Besides encouraging Maitland's work, he appealed to the Church Missionary Society for aid in a programme of educating Indians. He wanted his proposed university, King's College, to extend its benefits to Indians so that they might be trained as missionaries and then return to their people to teach. He also hoped some white students there would learn Indian languages so that they might be able to minister to the

¹⁷ Petition of United Brethren (Moravians) at Fairfield, May 1, 1801. Ontario Bureau of Archives, *Sixth Report* (Toronto, 1911), p. 206.

¹⁸ Ontario Archives (P.A.O.), Strachan Papers. Strachan to Church Missionary Society, February 27, 1827.

¹⁹ "Report of the Committee on Aborigines," Parliamentary Papers, 1836, VII, pp. 47-48.

Indians.²⁰ Not much came to these grand ideas. The 1836 prospectus of the Methodist Upper Canada Academy at Cobourg also spoke of the need "to educate the most promising youth of the recently converted Indian tribes of Canada, as Teachers to their aboriginal countrymen."²¹

On the practical level of conversion and civilization Strachan advised that teacher-missionaries should work side by side with Indians in the fields for the Indians, if not encouraged [sic] in this way would become disgusted, whereas the assistance of their masters and superiors would be of great excitement. In many cases, the Indians, even those who are partially civilized, think it beneath them to perform drudgery when the example has not been set by the employers.²²

Generally speaking, he was optimistic about the Indians. He reported them all to be "anxious to have their children educated," even if it meant leaving them behind while the men went off hunting.²³ "These children are found as apt to learn as those of whites, and acquire the common branches of instruction and expertness in the Mechanical arts with equal facility."²⁴ Strachan's report commented on their ready adaptability to the white man's ways, once they had been shown the desirability of these ends: "they are found to be docile...and very soon become clean and tidy in their persons." The use of the children to reach the parents—a common assimilative device used by the nation-state in the following hundred years—found Strachan's approval: "the Church can reach the parents through the children, and even should she be less successful with the adults, she can gradually get possession of the rising generation, and, in half an age, the tribe becomes Christian."²⁵ Two decades earlier, Maitland had made the same point: in civilizing and Christianizing the Indians "little perhaps can be expected from grown-up Indians;" rather success "will chiefly depend upon the influence" to be "acquired over the

²⁰ P.A.O., Strachan Papers. Strachan to Church Missionary Society, February 27, 1827. In answer to Strachan's request the Society granted £100 annually for the maintenance of two scholarships and £100 for a Professorship of Indian Languages. *Ibid.*, Church Missionary Society to Strachan, March 16, 1827.

²¹ In *D.H.E.*, II, 241.

²² P.A.O., Strachan Papers. Strachan to Bishop McDonell [sic], n.d., 1827.

²³ See also *Christian Guardian*, July 19, 1837: "There may indeed be instances where parents are indifferent as to the schooling of their children... But this is not generally the case. A great majority of the Indians ardently desire the improvement of their off-spring; and many of them make sacrifices, and suffer inconveniences which undeniably prove that they are by no means indifferent to the subject of education."

²⁴ Other observers concurred with this contention. An 1845 Report on the "Condition and Education of the Indian Tribes in Upper Canada," commissioned by Lieutenant-Governor Bagot in 1842, found that although Indian attendance was very irregular, "their ability in acquiring knowledge was in no way inferior to that of the White children." In *D.H.E.*, V, 293.

²⁵ J. STRACHAN, "A Charge Delivered to the Clergy of the Diocese of Toronto at the Triennial Visitation... (1844)" cited in J. L. H. HENDERSON (ed.), *John Strachan: Documents and Opinions* (Carleton Library series, Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1969), pp. 243-4.

young."²⁶ Reflective of the "civilizing" role of the school was the rule which adorned the wall of the Credit River School in 1830: "No blanket to be Worn in School."²⁷

Of all the Christian churches the Methodists had the most missionaries assigned to Indian tribes in Upper Canada. In the late 1820's and throughout the 1830's the pages of the annual reports of the Missionary Society of the Methodist Episcopal Church reveal the extent of Methodist involvement in Indian education.²⁸ The annual reports leave no doubt that the Methodist schools were primarily intended for converting the Indians to Christianity. "Nothing, in our opinion," an early report stated, "can rescue this people, but the power of the gospel."²⁹ A later report made the same point about religion being a necessary base for true education: "the principles of true religion are the foundation of every other improvement, and all that is noble and excellent in the character of man."³⁰ After conversion, the main purpose of educating Indians was to tender moral instruction. Indians must be led away from their uncivilized and depraved ways especially their proclivity to slothfulness and drunkenness. One report, however, very honestly questioned the effectiveness of education as a means of curbing drunkenness. A missionary at the Grand River found to his amazement that when pressed to embrace Christianity "pagan" Indians objected by saying, "the Christian Indians drink more whiskey than we."³¹ In any case, by 1830 the Methodists had established an extensive educational mission among the Indians with eleven schools, eleven teachers, and 400 students of whom 150" can read in the New Testament."³² "It was a sight most novel," one report concluded, "and to the friends of improvement very animating, to witness the tents of a tribe of pagan Indians pitched about the school for the purpose of affording to their children the means of education."³³

Another reformer of the period who, amongst his diverse humanitarian interests, numbered the education and training of Indians,

²⁶ Maitland to Lord Bathurst, November 29, 1821. Johnston (ed.), *Valley of the Six Nations*, p. 289.

²⁷ Report by William L. Mackenzie based on visit to Indian settlement at Credit River in December, 1830. In *D.H.E.*, II, 122.

²⁸ The Annual Reports of The Canada Conference Missionary Society of the Methodist Episcopal Church in Canada beginning in 1825 are housed in the United Church Archives in Toronto. In 1833 the name was changed to the Missionary Society Wesleyan Methodist Church in British North America.

²⁹ Canada Conference Missionary Society Methodist Church, *1825 Annual Report* (York, 1826), p. 7.

³⁰ *1829 Annual Report* (York, 1830), p. 7.

³¹ *1827 Annual Report* (York, 1828), p. 5.

³² *1829-31 Annual Report* (York, 1831), p. 3.

³³ *1826 Annual Report* (York, 1827), n. 5.

was Thaddeus Osgood. Born in Massachusetts in 1775, Osgood was educated at Dartmouth College, licensed to preach in 1804, and ordained a Congregational minister in 1806.³⁴ Three years later he came to Canada and began to distribute tracts designed "to make amusement and instruction friends" for thousands of little children.³⁵ A decade or so later he launched a society called The Central Auxiliary Society for Promoting Education and Industry in Canada, whose main responsibility was to aid in the establishment of schools among Indians and destitute settlers.³⁶ Most of the Indian schools mentioned by Osgood in his annual reports for the Society were serviced by missionaries sent out by the Missionary Society of the Methodist Episcopal Church. In all cases the monies were directed to the erection or support of Schools of Industry. The latter were designed primarily to teach Indian boys useful trades. Beyond the normal "civilizing" and "moralizing" benefits of such schools, there were additional practical advantages relating to the acquisition of useful skills such as shoe-making, carpentry, and cabinet-making.

By the end of the 1820's, Osgood, the inveterate optimist, was looking forward to the establishment of some kind of school for training Indian teachers. "The plan of training up Teachers from among the Indians and Emigrants," he reported, "appears so very important that they warmly recommend the opening of a Seminary, as soon as funds and a suitable Instructor can be procured."³⁷ Despite Osgood's plans, the Society came to an end in 1829. Osgood seems to have suffered from lack of official encouragement, but he certainly aroused a storm of controversy. Moved by loyalty to King, country, and established church, a Brockville minister directed Maitland's attention to an address in which he claimed Osgood had sung the praises of "liberty" in an equivocal fashion. Could Osgood have been referring to American-style "liberty" and not "religious liberty"? Certainly he spoke of carrying his "mission" to the United States of all places. He seemed, the critic continued, to be seeking "a union of the Indians of the United Stes and Canada." At the very least, he concluded, Osgood was undercutting the good work of the S.P.G. and of Maitland Himself.³⁸

³⁴ Biographical details are taken from *Appleton's Cyclopaedia of American Biography* (New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1888), p. 601.

³⁵ *York Gazette*, November 14, 1810. In Edith Firth, *The Town of York, 1793-1815* (Toronto: Champlain Society, 1962), pp. 210-211.

³⁶ See petition from Osgood to Maitland, P.A.C., Upper Canada Sundries (U.C.S.), December 19, 1826.

³⁷ Second Annual Report, Central Auxiliary Society for Promoting Education and Industry in Canada, p. 16. Cited in George W. SPRAGGE, "Monitorial Schools in the Canadas, 1810-1845" (D. Paed. thesis, University of Toronto, 1935), p. 212.

³⁸ P.A.C., U.C.S., Rev. John Wenham to Hillier, Brockville, January 12, 1827.

In the 1830's the role of lieutenant-governors in promoting education among the Indians was significant. Numerous reports testify to Sir John Colborne's efforts (1828-1836). One speaks of him as "the Friend and Benefactor of [the Indian] Race."³⁹ Another acknowledges his cooperation with the Wesleyan Methodist Missionary Society in its promotion of the religious and moral improvement of the Indians at Coldwater, Lake Simcoe Narrows, on the Thames River, and on Lake St. Clair.⁴⁰ According to reports from the various Indian Affairs superintendents, whose objectivity might be held suspect, wigwams were being exchanged for the loghouses built with government money. "The dress, demeanour and habits of many of the Indians," one report stated, "showed how successful had been the efforts to raise them from their state of squalor, dejectedness and intemperance."⁴¹ Colborne himself was ecstatic about the success of the assimilation policy:

...all the Indian Tribes in Canada are collected in Villages... Schools are instituted for their Benefit ...they are placed under the Care of Persons interested in their Welfare...few cases of Intoxication now occur, except among the visiting Indians chiefly resident in the United States.⁴²

Colborne's successor, Sir Francis Bond Head (1836-1838), was, however, not at all convinced of the alleged achievements with the Indian settlements. In a letter to Colonial Secretary Lord Glenelg, after having completed an inspection tour in the summer of 1836, Bond Head ridiculed as a "complete Failure" the "Attempt to make Farmers of the Red Men". Secondly, the idea of "congregating them for the Purpose of Civilization [had] implanted many more Vices than it [had] eradicated." He concluded that "the greatest Kindness we can perform toward these intelligent, simple-minded People, is to remove and fortify them as much as possible from all communication with the Whites"⁴³ — in other words, to carry out the responsibility of protecting the native peoples. His major project in this respect was the scheme to collect various Indian tribes living in the vicinity of Lake Huron and the Thames River and move them to Manitoulin Island in Lake Huron after turning over their own lands. The scheme was soon afterwards abandoned as Bond Head's attention was diverted by the events leading to the 1837 Rebellion and his departure for

³⁹ Alder to Lord Glenelg, December 14, 1837. *D.H.E.*, IV, 122.

⁴⁰ *Minutes of the Annual Conferences of the Wesleyan-Methodist Church in Canada, 1824-1845* (Toronto: Anson Green, 1846), p. 86 (for 1834).

⁴¹ In D. C. SCOTT, "Indian Affairs, 1841-1867," in *Canada and its Provinces*, V, 334.

⁴² Report of Captain T. G. ANDERSON, September 24, 1835, in Colborne to Glenelg, January 22, 1836. *Parliamentary Papers 1839*, p. 336. Cited in L.F.S. UPTON, "Indian Policy in the Canadas during the 1830's" (Unpublished Ms., October, 1972).

⁴³ Head to Glenelg, November 20, 1836. Cited in George K. MELLOR, *British Imperial Trusteeship, 1783-1850* (London: Faber and Faber, 1951), p. 389.

England the following spring. For their part the Indians found repellent the formalized and paternalistic nature of the forced settlement.⁴⁴

III

One of the burning issues associated with Indian education was the question of the language of instruction. Was it preferable to teach in the Indian or the English language? For the Methodists in the 1820's it was considered wise to use English, "there being so few translations into the Indian tongue." Once English was known, it would be "no difficult task to learn the scholars to read their native tongue."⁴⁵

A significant point in the teaching of English is the fact that the Pestalozzian system was used. The most important principle in learning, according to Pestalozzi, was sense impression. Consequently learning, he argued, resulted from accurate observation of actual objects rather than from recitation and rote memorization. Pestalozzi also placed great emphasis on tending to the needs of the child, and thus stressed the active involvement of the child in learning through drawing, writing, singing, map making and field trips.⁴⁶ Through what means this pedagogical system happened to come to the attention of the Methodist missionaries is not clear, but we do know it was not in general use in Upper Canada until at least mid-century thanks to its promotion then by Egerton Ryerson, the Superintendent of Schools. The advantages of the Pestalozzian system were set forth in the annual report of 1829 of the Methodist Missionary Society.

[It is] a system which combines instruction with amusement, and necessary bodily exercise with entertaining labour of mind, and renders the studies of the children delightful, at the same time as it promotes health and activity of body.⁴⁷

The first Indian school to follow this plan was the Grape Island School beginning in June 1828. Then the same year the Rice Lake school followed suit. The evaluation was most encouraging. "From the rapid improvement which the children in these schools have made, the committee are led to believe that the system should be introduced into the Native Schools generally."⁴⁸

⁴⁴ Egerton Ryerson's critique of the Manitoulin Island scheme was typical of the sort of opposition Head encountered. See *D.H.E.*, IV, 126.

⁴⁵ Canada Conference Missionary Society Methodist Episcopal Church, *1829 Annual Report*, p. 3.

⁴⁶ These principles are basic to modern education. For a recent study of Pestalozzi and his method, see M. R. HEAFFORD, *Pestalozzi: His Thought and Its Relevance Today* (London: Methuen and Company, 1967).

⁴⁷ *1829 Annual Report*, p. 3.

⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 4.

As more translations in Indian languages became available,⁴⁹ the controversy over language instruction became more heated. The Mohawk Indians at Tyendinaga (Bay of Quinté), for example, requested of Bishop Strachan in 1843 to be allowed to have a school where the Indian language would be used, as well as a second one with English. The late Bishop Stewart of Quebec had apparently supported such a plan. They even offered to pay for the cost of printing Indian books for use in the school.⁵⁰ The opposing view as expressed by Captain T. G. Anderson, a superintendent of Indian Affairs, has a decidedly present-day ring about it. He disapproved of Indian Testaments being used as text books "because the intercourse of the rising generation must be with the whites and it therefore appears to me that teaching them in their own language is time and labour lost."⁵¹

After converting the Indians and teaching them to pray and read and pursue "moral" lives, the missionaries and reformers realized this was not enough. The Indians must be introduced to "industrious labour" and "the acts of civilized life." Prompting this concern was a realization that the Indians' traditional mode of livelihood had been disrupted by the material advance of white society and the decline of the fur trade. As Strachan phrased it, "they could no longer live by hunting as the settlements were extending through every part of the Province and unless something was done to induce them to alter their mode of life they must inevitably" face destruction and ruin.⁵² A few years later this contention was verified by the Indians themselves. The Mohawks of the Bay of Quinté in an address to a general council of tribes at Orillia stated:

Let us sound the shell, and summon every Red man from the woods; let us give up the chase of the Deer and the Beaver; it is unprofitable. The White man's labour is fast eating away the forest, whilst the sound of his Axe in summer and his Bells in winter is driving the game far away from their old haunts; it will soon be all gone.⁵³

Maitland's plan to put Indians in village settlements was a move in the right direction, it would seem, but efforts must be made to introduce "the various arts of mechanism among this people."⁵⁴ Few Indians had

⁴⁹ Two examples of such texts can be seen at the Toronto Central Library. *Spelling for the Schools in the Chipeway Language* (York: Printed for the Canada Conference Missionary Society, 1828), and *A Hymnbook in Ojibwa Language prepared by Peter Jones* (Boston: Printed for the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions by Crocker & Brewster, 1836). Jones himself had an Ojibwa mother.

⁵⁰ P.A.O., Strachan Papers. Indians at Tyendinaga to Bishop of Toronto, September 7, 1843.

⁵¹ P.A.O., Strachan Papers. T. G. Anderson, S.I.A., Manitowaning, to Col. S. P. Jarvis, C.S.I.A., Kingston, March 4, 1863.

⁵² P.A.O., Strachan Papers. "Paper on the Religious State of the Indians in Upper Canada," December 2, 1837.

⁵³ *D.H.E.*, V, 297. Council met July 21, 1846.

⁵⁴ P.A.O., Strachan Papers. Peter Jones to Strachan, Grape Island, January 31, 1828.

enough new skills to compete in the white man's world. Cooperage, shoemaking, chair-making, cabinet-making, blacksmithing, tailoring — these were the useful skills to be taught; while the girls would learn sewing, knitting, cooking, washing and laundry work.

Schools of Industry were set up at Grape Island, Credit River, Alderville (Alnwick) near Rice Lake, and Mohawk village on the Grand River.⁵⁵ The Conference minutes of the Wesleyan Methodist Church in 1837 record adoption of a recommendation for the erection of a Central Manual Labour School for Indian Youth where their "religious, literary, mechanical and agricultural education" might be undertaken.⁵⁶ "The great work must be unweariedly persevered in," the recommendation continued, "until ... the practices of paganism cease to exist, habits of industry be formed, and peace and tranquility dwell in the midst of this people."⁵⁷ The additional advantage of a Central School would be the removal of the Indian children "from their imperfectly civilized parents" and their placement "under the exclusive direction of their religious and secular Instructors."⁵⁸ At the 1846 general council Captain Anderson emphasized that the point of establishing schools of industry was to enable Indian children to "forget their Indian habits, and be instructed in all the necessary arts of civilized life, and become one with [their] White brethren." Children would be well taken care of, fed and clothed. Parents would not be forced to relocate if they did not desire to, but "their children must go to the Schools."⁵⁹

In 1845 the Rev. Peter Jones, one of the most energetic missionaries among the Indians, collected enough money to establish the Mount Elgin Industrial Institution at Munceytown Reserve whose aims and objectives closely parallel those of the superintendent of the Choctaw Academy for Indians in the United States.⁶⁰ The object of the Institution was "to

⁵⁵ During one two-week period, the students at Alderville manufactured 172 axe handles, 6 scoop shovels, 57 ladles, 4 trays, 44 broom handles and 415 brooms. This fine effort was acknowledged by having the articles sent on a travelling exhibition to the United States. G. F. PLAYTER, *History of Methodism in Canada* (Toronto: William Briggs, 1862), p. 343.

⁵⁶ *Minutes of the Annual Conferences of the Wesleyan-Methodist Church in Canada, 1824-1845* (Toronto: Anson Green, 1846), p. 160. 1837 meeting held June 14-24 in Toronto.

⁵⁷ *Christian Guardian*, July 19, 1837.

⁵⁸ Rev. Dr. Alder to Lord Glenelg, December 14, 1837. *D.H.E.*, IV, 122.

⁵⁹ *D.H.E.*, V, 296.

⁶⁰ Founded in 1825 by a United States senator from Kentucky in co-operation with the Baptist General Convention, the Academy might be improved, its superintendent argued in 1832, by "a few workshops, embracing the most useful and necessary mechanical arts for the promotion of civilized life: say a blacksmith, shoemaker, and wheelwright who understood stocking ploughs; or any other which would seem best calculated to suit the present condition of the Indians." Robert H. BREMNER (ed.), *Children and Youth in America: A Documentary History* (2 vols., Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1970), vol. I, p. 554.

Christianize and elevate the Indian youth of our country, to teach the boys useful trades, viz. shoe-making, carpentering and cabinet-making, as well as the correct principles of farming; and the girls, sewing, knitting, spinning and general house work." As to their moral and civic education, "the greatest care is taken to inculcate habits of industry and frugality, which are essential to the future prosperity and happiness of our Indians."⁶¹ The problems of adjustment to white society, it was thought, could best be met if Indians learned to hold and respect the same values as the white man, and these values were contained in the words "industry and frugality."

IV

The long-lasting sense of alienation and frustration felt by many Indians towards Canadian society is in part a product of the educational system to which they were subjected in the nineteenth century. The "civilizing" mission of church and state was succeeded by the schools-of-industry concept with its aim of making Indians both useful and reasonably self-sufficient. Both policies, while well-meaning, were based on an overweening paternalism against which Indians finally reacted with vehemence in our own day.⁶²

⁶¹ Cited in George H. CORNISH, *Cyclopaedia of Methodism in Canada* (Toronto: Methodist Book and Publishing House, 1881), p. 551. The Choctaw Academy superintendent considered, "...it is equally certain, that nothing will tend more rapidly to promote civilized habits among that unfortunate race of people (in addition to even a moderate English education) than the encouragement of the mechanical arts." Bremner, p. 555.

⁶² As early as 1841 Lieutenant-Governor Sydenham perceived the dangers of paternalism when he spoke of "the general truth that a government undertaking to assume a parental relation to adult men and women is sure to do itself and them unmixed harm." Cited in MELLOR, *British Imperial Trusteeship*, p. 413.